

# Supplementary Appendix for: The Generalizability of Heterogeneous Treatment Effect Estimates Across Samples

Alexander Coppock, Thomas J. Leeper, Kevin J. Mullinix\*

March 29, 2018

In this appendix, we first provide tables with citations to each study used in our analysis. The subsequent reference list has the corresponding publications produced from the TESS studies used in our replications. These referenced publications are simply those listed on the TESS website alongside the study information. Readers should note that our analytical strategy, group comparisons, and dependent variables may or may not be the ones employed in the publications by the TESS Principal Investigators who designed the studies. That is, we take a uniform analytical approach to all of the studies; we do not attempt to directly reproduce and replicate the analyses from the corresponding publications. A complete description of each experiment and replication procedures are available in the original papers and their supplementary materials (Mullinix et al. 2015; Coppock forthcoming) as well as on the TESS website study archives: <http://www.tessexperiments.org/previousstudies.html>

In additional tables, we provide the conditional average treatment effect estimate (CATE) by covariate class, experiment, and sample. In essence, these tables constitute the raw data from which our summaries are calculated.

In each table, the CATE column refers to the difference-in-means estimate of the treatment effect, conditional on membership in the covariate class. The SE column refers to the Neyman standard error, equivalent to HC2 robust standard errors. All  $p$ -values are two-sided and are not corrected for multiple comparisons. The Prop column describes what proportion of the subjects in a given experiment belong to the associated covariate class.

---

\*Alexander Coppock is Assistant Professor of Political Science, Yale University, Thomas J. Leeper is Associate Professor in Political Behaviour, London School of Economics and Political Science, Kevin J. Mullinix is Assistant Professor of Political Science, Appalachian State University.

Table 1: Coppock (forthcoming) Replication Studies

Study
Brader (2005)
Chong and Druckman (2010)
Craig and Richeson (2014)
Hiscox (2006)
Hopkins and Mummolo (2017)
Johnston and Ballard (2016)
Levendusky and Malhotra (2015)
McGinty, Webster and Barry (2013)
Nicholson (2012)
Peffley and Hurwitz (2007)
Transue (2007)

Table 2: Mullinix et al. (2015) Replication Studies

Study
Bergan (2012)
Brandt (2009)
Caprariello (2011)
Converse and Epley (2007)
Denny (2012)
Flavin (2011)
Gash and Murakami (2009)
Jacobsen (2011); Jacobsen, Snyder and Saultz (2014)
Mello (2010)
Parmer (2011)
Pedulla (2011, 2014)
Piazza (2011, 2015)
Shafer (2010)
Thompson (2011)
Turaga (2010)
Wallace (2011)

Table 3: Bergan (2012) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.22	0.22	0.32	[-0.65, 0.21]	139	0.35
Age: 40 - 59	-0.20	0.17	0.24	[-0.55, 0.14]	134	0.34
Age: More than 60	0.12	0.23	0.61	[-0.34, 0.58]	123	0.31
Party ID: Democrat	0.16	0.18	0.35	[-0.18, 0.51]	206	0.52
Party ID: Independent	0.90	0.44	0.07	[-0.07, 1.86]	14	0.04
Party ID: Republican	-0.54	0.17	0.00	[-0.88, -0.21]	176	0.44
Race: White	-0.17	0.13	0.19	[-0.41, 0.08]	285	0.72
Race: Nonwhite	-0.06	0.27	0.83	[-0.59, 0.48]	111	0.28
Education: Less than College	-0.19	0.15	0.19	[-0.48, 0.10]	283	0.71
Education: College	0.18	0.27	0.50	[-0.36, 0.73]	66	0.17
Education: Graduate School	-0.39	0.33	0.24	[-1.06, 0.28]	47	0.12
Gender: Male	-0.04	0.16	0.81	[-0.36, 0.28]	204	0.52
Gender: Female	-0.22	0.18	0.22	[-0.58, 0.14]	192	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	0.44	0.21	0.04	[0.02, 0.86]	113	0.29
Ideology: Moderate	-0.01	0.18	0.94	[-0.37, 0.34]	134	0.34
Ideology: Conservative	-0.72	0.22	0.00	[-1.15, -0.29]	149	0.38

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	0.37	0.09	0.00	[0.20, 0.54]	480	0.82
Age: 40 - 59	-0.15	0.21	0.46	[-0.56, 0.26]	91	0.16
Age: More than 60	0.15	0.53	0.78	[-0.98, 1.28]	16	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	0.51	0.10	0.00	[0.32, 0.71]	375	0.64
Party ID: Independent	0.10	0.20	0.64	[-0.31, 0.50]	84	0.14
Party ID: Republican	-0.39	0.18	0.03	[-0.74, -0.04]	128	0.22
Race: White	0.23	0.09	0.01	[0.05, 0.41]	461	0.79
Race: Nonwhite	0.36	0.17	0.04	[0.02, 0.70]	126	0.21
Education: Less than College	0.32	0.11	0.00	[0.10, 0.54]	311	0.53
Education: College	0.04	0.13	0.78	[-0.22, 0.29]	223	0.38
Education: Graduate School	0.76	0.26	0.00	[0.24, 1.27]	53	0.09
Gender: Male	0.21	0.11	0.06	[-0.01, 0.42]	327	0.56
Gender: Female	0.29	0.12	0.01	[0.06, 0.52]	260	0.44
Ideology: Liberal	0.50	0.10	0.00	[0.30, 0.71]	336	0.57
Ideology: Moderate	0.25	0.17	0.14	[-0.08, 0.58]	138	0.24
Ideology: Conservative	-0.48	0.18	0.01	[-0.84, -0.12]	113	0.19

Table 4: Brader (2005) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.09	0.23	0.70	[-0.37, 0.54]	95	0.34
Age: 40 - 59	0.72	0.33	0.03	[0.06, 1.38]	107	0.38
Age: More than 60	0.55	0.30	0.07	[-0.04, 1.15]	78	0.28
Party ID: Democrat	0.55	0.31	0.08	[-0.07, 1.17]	108	0.39
Party ID: Independent	0.46	0.25	0.07	[-0.05, 0.96]	54	0.19
Party ID: Republican	0.55	0.28	0.05	[-0.00, 1.11]	118	0.42
Race: White	0.47	0.18	0.01	[0.13, 0.82]	280	1.00
Education: Less than College	0.23	0.20	0.25	[-0.17, 0.63]	193	0.69
Education: College	0.83	0.38	0.03	[0.07, 1.59]	58	0.21
Education: Graduate School	1.11	0.50	0.04	[0.08, 2.14]	29	0.10
Gender: Male	0.34	0.25	0.18	[-0.16, 0.83]	134	0.48
Gender: Female	0.61	0.25	0.02	[0.11, 1.11]	146	0.52
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.35	0.07	0.00	[0.22, 0.47]	1297	0.76
Age: 40 - 59	0.26	0.13	0.05	[0.00, 0.51]	356	0.21
Age: More than 60	0.43	0.36	0.24	[-0.29, 1.15]	56	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	0.30	0.07	0.00	[0.17, 0.44]	1044	0.61
Party ID: Independent	0.47	0.16	0.00	[0.16, 0.77]	270	0.16
Party ID: Republican	0.26	0.13	0.04	[0.01, 0.51]	395	0.23
Race: White	0.31	0.07	0.00	[0.17, 0.44]	1293	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.34	0.11	0.00	[0.12, 0.55]	416	0.24
Education: Less than College	0.27	0.09	0.00	[0.10, 0.44]	852	0.50
Education: College	0.30	0.09	0.00	[0.12, 0.48]	649	0.38
Education: Graduate School	0.51	0.16	0.00	[0.20, 0.82]	208	0.12
Gender: Male	0.19	0.09	0.02	[0.03, 0.36]	825	0.48
Gender: Female	0.42	0.08	0.00	[0.26, 0.58]	884	0.52

Table 5: Brandt (2009) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.44	0.19	0.02	[-0.82, -0.07]	153	0.24
Age: 40 - 59	-0.37	0.14	0.01	[-0.65, -0.09]	271	0.43
Age: More than 60	-0.47	0.17	0.01	[-0.81, -0.12]	201	0.32
Party ID: Democrat	-0.53	0.14	0.00	[-0.81, -0.26]	324	0.52
Party ID: Independent	0.49	0.54	0.38	[-0.63, 1.60]	26	0.04
Party ID: Republican	-0.33	0.15	0.04	[-0.63, -0.02]	275	0.44
Race: White	-0.41	0.11	0.00	[-0.63, -0.19]	464	0.74
Race: Nonwhite	-0.38	0.20	0.05	[-0.78, 0.01]	161	0.26
Education: Less than College	-0.43	0.12	0.00	[-0.66, -0.19]	450	0.72
Education: College	-0.60	0.23	0.01	[-1.05, -0.14]	110	0.18
Education: Graduate School	0.15	0.30	0.61	[-0.45, 0.75]	65	0.10
Gender: Male	-0.30	0.16	0.05	[-0.61, 0.00]	311	0.50
Gender: Female	-0.49	0.13	0.00	[-0.74, -0.24]	314	0.50
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.79	0.06	0.00	[-0.89, -0.68]	1210	0.77
Age: 40 - 59	-0.80	0.10	0.00	[-0.99, -0.60]	310	0.20
Age: More than 60	-0.51	0.25	0.04	[-1.01, -0.02]	52	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	-0.77	0.06	0.00	[-0.89, -0.65]	1029	0.65
Party ID: Independent	-0.72	0.14	0.00	[-1.00, -0.45]	176	0.11
Party ID: Republican	-0.78	0.10	0.00	[-0.97, -0.59]	367	0.23
Race: White	-0.81	0.05	0.00	[-0.91, -0.71]	1225	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	-0.66	0.11	0.00	[-0.89, -0.44]	347	0.22
Education: Less than College	-0.81	0.07	0.00	[-0.94, -0.68]	831	0.53
Education: College	-0.78	0.08	0.00	[-0.93, -0.62]	586	0.37
Education: Graduate School	-0.58	0.15	0.00	[-0.88, -0.28]	155	0.10
Gender: Male	-0.71	0.07	0.00	[-0.85, -0.58]	779	0.50
Gender: Female	-0.83	0.07	0.00	[-0.96, -0.70]	793	0.50

Table 6: Caprariello (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.42	0.28	0.14	[-0.98, 0.14]	117	0.29
Age: 40 - 59	-0.15	0.23	0.52	[-0.62, 0.31]	150	0.38
Age: More than 60	-0.07	0.20	0.71	[-0.47, 0.32]	132	0.33
Party ID: Democrat	-0.49	0.21	0.02	[-0.91, -0.06]	197	0.49
Party ID: Independent	0.00	0.43	1.00	[-0.87, 0.87]	46	0.12
Party ID: Republican	0.05	0.21	0.80	[-0.36, 0.47]	156	0.39
Race: White	-0.29	0.16	0.07	[-0.61, 0.03]	298	0.75
Race: Nonwhite	-0.13	0.30	0.68	[-0.73, 0.48]	101	0.25
Education: Less than College	-0.09	0.18	0.62	[-0.43, 0.26]	258	0.65
Education: College	-0.49	0.30	0.11	[-1.09, 0.11]	79	0.20
Education: Graduate School	-0.77	0.36	0.04	[-1.50, -0.05]	62	0.16
Gender: Male	-0.31	0.19	0.12	[-0.69, 0.08]	213	0.53
Gender: Female	-0.17	0.22	0.44	[-0.60, 0.26]	186	0.47
Ideology: Liberal	-0.58	0.30	0.06	[-1.18, 0.01]	114	0.29
Ideology: Moderate	-0.13	0.25	0.59	[-0.62, 0.36]	136	0.34
Ideology: Conservative	-0.11	0.21	0.58	[-0.52, 0.30]	149	0.37

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.14	0.06	0.02	[-0.26, -0.02]	994	0.78
Age: 40 - 59	-0.07	0.13	0.61	[-0.32, 0.18]	241	0.19
Age: More than 60	-0.19	0.29	0.50	[-0.78, 0.39]	47	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	-0.08	0.07	0.26	[-0.21, 0.06]	796	0.62
Party ID: Independent	-0.24	0.16	0.15	[-0.56, 0.09]	161	0.13
Party ID: Republican	-0.19	0.11	0.08	[-0.40, 0.02]	325	0.25
Race: White	-0.15	0.06	0.02	[-0.27, -0.03]	969	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.06	0.12	0.59	[-0.30, 0.17]	313	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.15	0.08	0.05	[-0.30, -0.00]	705	0.55
Education: College	-0.07	0.09	0.42	[-0.24, 0.10]	446	0.35
Education: Graduate School	-0.18	0.18	0.30	[-0.53, 0.16]	131	0.10
Gender: Male	-0.06	0.08	0.43	[-0.21, 0.09]	616	0.48
Gender: Female	-0.19	0.08	0.01	[-0.34, -0.04]	666	0.52
Ideology: Liberal	-0.07	0.07	0.32	[-0.21, 0.07]	721	0.56
Ideology: Moderate	-0.28	0.12	0.02	[-0.51, -0.05]	299	0.23
Ideology: Conservative	-0.10	0.12	0.41	[-0.35, 0.14]	262	0.20

Table 7: Chong and Druckman (2010) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.68	0.12	0.00	[0.44, 0.92]	231	0.24
Age: 40 - 59	0.88	0.09	0.00	[0.69, 1.06]	380	0.40
Age: More than 60	0.81	0.11	0.00	[0.59, 1.02]	347	0.36
Party ID: Democrat	0.75	0.09	0.00	[0.56, 0.93]	413	0.43
Party ID: Independent	0.89	0.13	0.00	[0.64, 1.14]	213	0.22
Party ID: Republican	0.81	0.10	0.00	[0.61, 1.01]	332	0.35
Race: White	0.79	0.07	0.00	[0.65, 0.93]	699	0.73
Race: Nonwhite	0.85	0.12	0.00	[0.62, 1.08]	259	0.27
Education: Less than College	0.81	0.08	0.00	[0.65, 0.96]	528	0.55
Education: College	0.82	0.12	0.00	[0.58, 1.05]	281	0.29
Education: Graduate School	0.80	0.17	0.00	[0.47, 1.13]	149	0.16
Gender: Male	0.73	0.09	0.00	[0.55, 0.91]	495	0.52
Gender: Female	0.88	0.08	0.00	[0.71, 1.04]	463	0.48

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.54	0.06	0.00	[0.41, 0.66]	1056	0.75
Age: 40 - 59	0.74	0.12	0.00	[0.50, 0.98]	298	0.21
Age: More than 60	1.19	0.31	0.00	[0.57, 1.80]	46	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	0.56	0.07	0.00	[0.42, 0.69]	812	0.58
Party ID: Independent	0.61	0.12	0.00	[0.37, 0.85]	264	0.19
Party ID: Republican	0.69	0.11	0.00	[0.48, 0.90]	324	0.23
Race: White	0.64	0.06	0.00	[0.52, 0.77]	959	0.69
Race: Nonwhite	0.52	0.09	0.00	[0.33, 0.70]	441	0.32
Education: Less than College	0.68	0.08	0.00	[0.53, 0.83]	677	0.48
Education: College	0.54	0.09	0.00	[0.36, 0.71]	546	0.39
Education: Graduate School	0.53	0.16	0.00	[0.21, 0.85]	177	0.13
Gender: Male	0.50	0.07	0.00	[0.35, 0.64]	809	0.58
Gender: Female	0.74	0.08	0.00	[0.58, 0.89]	591	0.42

Table 8: Converse (2008) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	0.24	0.17	0.15	[-0.09, 0.56]	177	0.35
Age: 40 - 59	0.30	0.17	0.09	[-0.04, 0.63]	214	0.42
Age: More than 60	0.35	0.25	0.16	[-0.14, 0.84]	117	0.23
Race: White	0.23	0.12	0.06	[-0.01, 0.48]	395	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.39	0.21	0.06	[-0.01, 0.80]	113	0.22
Education: Less than College	0.29	0.13	0.02	[0.04, 0.53]	360	0.71
Education: College	0.07	0.27	0.79	[-0.47, 0.62]	93	0.18
Education: Graduate School	0.66	0.33	0.05	[0.00, 1.31]	55	0.11
Gender: Male	0.45	0.15	0.00	[0.16, 0.74]	259	0.51
Gender: Female	0.13	0.15	0.40	[-0.17, 0.43]	249	0.49

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	0.10	0.07	0.13	[-0.03, 0.23]	705	0.79
Age: 40 - 59	-0.15	0.16	0.34	[-0.47, 0.17]	155	0.17
Age: More than 60	0.18	0.33	0.60	[-0.50, 0.85]	33	0.04
Race: White	0.05	0.07	0.45	[-0.08, 0.19]	696	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.13	0.13	0.32	[-0.13, 0.38]	197	0.22
Education: Less than College	-0.04	0.08	0.65	[-0.20, 0.12]	487	0.55
Education: College	0.19	0.11	0.07	[-0.02, 0.40]	315	0.35
Education: Graduate School	0.21	0.20	0.29	[-0.18, 0.60]	91	0.10
Gender: Male	0.12	0.08	0.14	[-0.04, 0.27]	483	0.54
Gender: Female	0.02	0.10	0.84	[-0.17, 0.21]	410	0.46



Table 9: Craig and Richeson (2014) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	0.23	0.16	0.16	[-0.09, 0.55]	188	0.31
Age: 40 - 59	-0.14	0.16	0.37	[-0.45, 0.17]	237	0.39
Age: More than 60	-0.18	0.15	0.23	[-0.48, 0.12]	183	0.30
Party ID: Democrat	0.14	0.14	0.31	[-0.13, 0.41]	298	0.49
Party ID: Independent	-0.00	0.56	1.00	[-1.18, 1.18]	18	0.03
Party ID: Republican	-0.19	0.13	0.16	[-0.46, 0.08]	292	0.48
Race: White	-0.13	0.10	0.22	[-0.33, 0.08]	464	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.23	0.19	0.23	[-0.15, 0.60]	144	0.24
Education: Less than College	0.04	0.11	0.71	[-0.18, 0.26]	415	0.68
Education: College	-0.20	0.24	0.41	[-0.68, 0.28]	110	0.18
Education: Graduate School	0.03	0.28	0.91	[-0.53, 0.59]	83	0.14
Gender: Male	-0.00	0.15	1.00	[-0.29, 0.29]	296	0.49
Gender: Female	-0.00	0.12	0.97	[-0.25, 0.24]	312	0.51
Ideology: Liberal	0.05	0.18	0.78	[-0.30, 0.40]	147	0.24
Ideology: Moderate	0.12	0.15	0.42	[-0.18, 0.42]	226	0.37
Ideology: Conservative	-0.20	0.16	0.22	[-0.52, 0.12]	235	0.39

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.25	0.08	0.00	[-0.41, -0.09]	524	0.74
Age: 40 - 59	-0.13	0.16	0.43	[-0.44, 0.18]	158	0.22
Age: More than 60	-0.34	0.43	0.43	[-1.23, 0.54]	27	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	-0.29	0.08	0.00	[-0.46, -0.13]	422	0.60
Party ID: Independent	-0.40	0.22	0.08	[-0.85, 0.05]	96	0.14
Party ID: Republican	0.10	0.14	0.48	[-0.18, 0.37]	191	0.27
Race: White	-0.19	0.08	0.02	[-0.35, -0.02]	569	0.80
Race: Nonwhite	-0.36	0.14	0.01	[-0.64, -0.08]	140	0.20
Education: Less than College	-0.29	0.11	0.01	[-0.51, -0.08]	344	0.49
Education: College	-0.07	0.11	0.51	[-0.29, 0.14]	290	0.41
Education: Graduate School	-0.40	0.23	0.09	[-0.86, 0.06]	75	0.11
Gender: Male	-0.12	0.10	0.23	[-0.33, 0.08]	331	0.47
Gender: Female	-0.30	0.10	0.00	[-0.51, -0.10]	378	0.53
Ideology: Liberal	-0.26	0.09	0.01	[-0.44, -0.07]	328	0.46
Ideology: Moderate	-0.35	0.13	0.01	[-0.60, -0.10]	216	0.30
Ideology: Conservative	0.08	0.16	0.60	[-0.23, 0.40]	165	0.23

Table 10: Denny (2012) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.51	0.27	0.06	[-0.02, 1.04]	99	0.34
Age: 40 - 59	0.35	0.20	0.07	[-0.04, 0.74]	163	0.56
Age: More than 60	-0.40	0.42	0.34	[-1.26, 0.45]	31	0.11
Party ID: Democrat	0.54	0.20	0.01	[0.13, 0.94]	158	0.54
Party ID: Independent	-0.45	0.56	0.45	[-1.77, 0.87]	9	0.03
Party ID: Republican	0.13	0.23	0.58	[-0.33, 0.58]	126	0.43
Race: White	0.04	0.15	0.78	[-0.26, 0.35]	219	0.75
Race: Nonwhite	1.04	0.29	0.00	[0.47, 1.62]	74	0.25
Education: Less than College	0.26	0.19	0.18	[-0.12, 0.64]	175	0.60
Education: College	0.75	0.31	0.02	[0.13, 1.37]	72	0.25
Education: Graduate School	0.12	0.32	0.72	[-0.53, 0.77]	46	0.16
Gender: Male	0.24	0.23	0.31	[-0.22, 0.70]	146	0.50
Gender: Female	0.49	0.19	0.01	[0.11, 0.87]	147	0.50
Ideology: Liberal	0.79	0.29	0.01	[0.22, 1.37]	85	0.29
Ideology: Moderate	-0.04	0.24	0.88	[-0.51, 0.44]	110	0.38
Ideology: Conservative	0.34	0.24	0.16	[-0.13, 0.81]	98	0.33

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.09	0.12	0.46	[-0.14, 0.32]	237	0.79
Age: 40 - 59	0.18	0.27	0.50	[-0.36, 0.72]	53	0.18
Age: More than 60	-0.56	0.62	0.39	[-1.96, 0.84]	11	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	0.08	0.14	0.56	[-0.19, 0.35]	181	0.60
Party ID: Independent	-0.20	0.31	0.52	[-0.83, 0.42]	40	0.13
Party ID: Republican	0.17	0.20	0.40	[-0.23, 0.58]	80	0.27
Race: White	0.01	0.12	0.96	[-0.23, 0.24]	236	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.31	0.24	0.20	[-0.17, 0.79]	65	0.22
Education: Less than College	0.13	0.15	0.38	[-0.16, 0.42]	157	0.52
Education: College	0.13	0.16	0.42	[-0.19, 0.46]	119	0.40
Education: Graduate School	-0.27	0.39	0.48	[-1.07, 0.52]	25	0.08
Gender: Male	-0.11	0.14	0.44	[-0.40, 0.17]	156	0.52
Gender: Female	0.27	0.15	0.08	[-0.04, 0.57]	145	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	0.14	0.14	0.32	[-0.14, 0.43]	154	0.51
Ideology: Moderate	-0.13	0.23	0.59	[-0.58, 0.33]	81	0.27
Ideology: Conservative	0.07	0.21	0.74	[-0.35, 0.49]	66	0.22

Table 11: Flavin (2009) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.65	0.15	0.00	[-0.96, -0.35]	219	0.28
Age: 40 - 59	-0.74	0.14	0.00	[-1.02, -0.46]	300	0.39
Age: More than 60	-0.84	0.15	0.00	[-1.15, -0.54]	251	0.33
Party ID: Democrat	-0.68	0.12	0.00	[-0.91, -0.44]	399	0.52
Party ID: Independent	0.05	0.60	0.93	[-1.27, 1.38]	13	0.02
Party ID: Republican	-0.78	0.14	0.00	[-1.05, -0.51]	358	0.46
Race: White	-0.75	0.10	0.00	[-0.95, -0.55]	601	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	-0.71	0.17	0.00	[-1.04, -0.37]	169	0.22
Education: Less than College	-0.87	0.11	0.00	[-1.07, -0.66]	514	0.67
Education: College	-0.39	0.20	0.06	[-0.79, 0.01]	157	0.20
Education: Graduate School	-0.39	0.24	0.12	[-0.87, 0.10]	99	0.13
Gender: Male	-0.75	0.13	0.00	[-1.00, -0.50]	389	0.51
Gender: Female	-0.72	0.12	0.00	[-0.97, -0.48]	381	0.49
Ideology: Liberal	-0.71	0.17	0.00	[-1.04, -0.39]	209	0.27
Ideology: Moderate	-0.59	0.15	0.00	[-0.88, -0.29]	277	0.36
Ideology: Conservative	-0.87	0.15	0.00	[-1.15, -0.58]	284	0.37
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.39	0.07	0.00	[-0.53, -0.25]	795	0.79
Age: 40 - 59	-0.57	0.15	0.00	[-0.86, -0.27]	179	0.18
Age: More than 60	-0.68	0.49	0.18	[-1.68, 0.33]	29	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	-0.31	0.07	0.00	[-0.45, -0.17]	621	0.62
Party ID: Independent	-0.47	0.16	0.00	[-0.79, -0.16]	139	0.14
Party ID: Republican	-0.69	0.14	0.00	[-0.97, -0.40]	243	0.24
Race: White	-0.39	0.07	0.00	[-0.54, -0.25]	766	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.54	0.12	0.00	[-0.78, -0.30]	237	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.38	0.08	0.00	[-0.55, -0.22]	545	0.54
Education: College	-0.43	0.11	0.00	[-0.64, -0.22]	356	0.35
Education: Graduate School	-0.65	0.20	0.00	[-1.05, -0.25]	102	0.10
Gender: Male	-0.31	0.10	0.00	[-0.50, -0.12]	497	0.50
Gender: Female	-0.56	0.08	0.00	[-0.72, -0.40]	506	0.50
Ideology: Liberal	-0.34	0.07	0.00	[-0.49, -0.20]	578	0.58
Ideology: Moderate	-0.24	0.13	0.06	[-0.49, 0.01]	224	0.22
Ideology: Conservative	-0.98	0.15	0.00	[-1.29, -0.68]	201	0.20

Table 12: Gash (2009) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.73	0.22	0.00	[-1.16, -0.30]	159	0.32
Age: 40 - 59	-0.51	0.18	0.01	[-0.86, -0.15]	203	0.41
Age: More than 60	-0.92	0.20	0.00	[-1.33, -0.52]	134	0.27
Party ID: Democrat	-0.89	0.15	0.00	[-1.18, -0.60]	263	0.53
Party ID: Independent	-1.62	0.50	0.01	[-2.71, -0.53]	15	0.03
Party ID: Republican	-0.38	0.20	0.05	[-0.77, 0.01]	218	0.44
Race: White	-0.63	0.13	0.00	[-0.88, -0.39]	384	0.77
Race: Nonwhite	-0.82	0.26	0.00	[-1.34, -0.30]	112	0.23
Education: Less than College	-0.84	0.14	0.00	[-1.12, -0.56]	358	0.72
Education: College	-0.41	0.22	0.07	[-0.85, 0.03]	85	0.17
Education: Graduate School	-0.10	0.36	0.79	[-0.81, 0.62]	53	0.11
Gender: Male	-0.64	0.16	0.00	[-0.95, -0.32]	258	0.52
Gender: Female	-0.74	0.17	0.00	[-1.08, -0.40]	238	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	-0.62	0.24	0.01	[-1.08, -0.15]	133	0.27
Ideology: Moderate	-0.86	0.19	0.00	[-1.22, -0.49]	185	0.37
Ideology: Conservative	-0.57	0.20	0.00	[-0.97, -0.18]	178	0.36

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.71	0.06	0.00	[-0.83, -0.60]	1152	0.76
Age: 40 - 59	-0.50	0.12	0.00	[-0.75, -0.26]	312	0.21
Age: More than 60	-0.70	0.26	0.01	[-1.22, -0.18]	55	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	-0.65	0.07	0.00	[-0.78, -0.52]	964	0.63
Party ID: Independent	-1.03	0.16	0.00	[-1.35, -0.72]	167	0.11
Party ID: Republican	-0.61	0.10	0.00	[-0.81, -0.40]	388	0.26
Race: White	-0.69	0.06	0.00	[-0.81, -0.57]	1154	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.63	0.11	0.00	[-0.83, -0.42]	365	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.75	0.07	0.00	[-0.90, -0.61]	790	0.52
Education: College	-0.62	0.09	0.00	[-0.79, -0.45]	564	0.37
Education: Graduate School	-0.42	0.17	0.01	[-0.75, -0.09]	165	0.11
Gender: Male	-0.72	0.07	0.00	[-0.87, -0.58]	748	0.49
Gender: Female	-0.63	0.08	0.00	[-0.78, -0.48]	771	0.51
Ideology: Liberal	-0.72	0.07	0.00	[-0.86, -0.58]	879	0.58
Ideology: Moderate	-0.64	0.12	0.00	[-0.86, -0.41]	296	0.19
Ideology: Conservative	-0.64	0.11	0.00	[-0.86, -0.43]	344	0.23

Table 13: Hiscox (2006) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.36	0.09	0.00	[0.17, 0.54]	545	0.34
Age: 40 - 59	0.14	0.09	0.13	[-0.04, 0.32]	648	0.40
Age: More than 60	0.21	0.12	0.06	[-0.01, 0.44]	408	0.25
Party ID: Democrat	0.17	0.09	0.06	[-0.00, 0.34]	697	0.44
Party ID: Independent	0.32	0.14	0.02	[0.06, 0.59]	286	0.18
Party ID: Republican	0.27	0.09	0.00	[0.09, 0.44]	618	0.39
Race: White	0.26	0.07	0.00	[0.14, 0.39]	1198	0.75
Race: Nonwhite	0.13	0.12	0.29	[-0.11, 0.36]	406	0.25
Education: Less than College	0.25	0.07	0.00	[0.11, 0.40]	1049	0.66
Education: College	0.27	0.11	0.01	[0.06, 0.48]	348	0.22
Education: Graduate School	-0.03	0.15	0.84	[-0.33, 0.27]	204	0.13
Gender: Male	0.13	0.09	0.14	[-0.04, 0.30]	672	0.42
Gender: Female	0.30	0.08	0.00	[0.15, 0.45]	932	0.58
Ideology: Liberal	0.21	0.13	0.12	[-0.06, 0.47]	257	0.16
Ideology: Moderate	0.28	0.08	0.00	[0.13, 0.43]	918	0.57
Ideology: Conservative	0.13	0.11	0.25	[-0.09, 0.35]	426	0.27
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.27	0.04	0.00	[0.19, 0.34]	1875	0.63
Age: 40 - 59	0.25	0.06	0.00	[0.13, 0.37]	850	0.29
Age: More than 60	0.19	0.11	0.10	[-0.04, 0.41]	238	0.08
Party ID: Democrat	0.22	0.04	0.00	[0.15, 0.30]	1767	0.60
Party ID: Independent	0.33	0.08	0.00	[0.17, 0.50]	426	0.14
Party ID: Republican	0.30	0.07	0.00	[0.17, 0.42]	770	0.26
Race: White	0.27	0.04	0.00	[0.20, 0.34]	2259	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.21	0.06	0.00	[0.10, 0.32]	707	0.24
Education: Less than College	0.29	0.04	0.00	[0.20, 0.38]	1531	0.52
Education: College	0.22	0.05	0.00	[0.12, 0.32]	1066	0.36
Education: Graduate School	0.20	0.08	0.01	[0.05, 0.35]	366	0.12
Gender: Male	0.21	0.04	0.00	[0.13, 0.29]	1431	0.48
Gender: Female	0.30	0.05	0.00	[0.21, 0.39]	1535	0.52
Ideology: Liberal	0.21	0.04	0.00	[0.13, 0.30]	1406	0.47
Ideology: Moderate	0.28	0.06	0.00	[0.17, 0.39]	957	0.32
Ideology: Conservative	0.32	0.07	0.00	[0.17, 0.46]	600	0.20

Table 14: Hopkins and Mummolo (2017) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.19	0.08	0.01	[-0.33, -0.04]	928	0.28
Age: 40 - 59	-0.16	0.07	0.03	[-0.30, -0.02]	1323	0.41
Age: More than 60	-0.14	0.08	0.09	[-0.30, 0.02]	1015	0.31
Party ID: Democrat	-0.08	0.07	0.27	[-0.22, 0.06]	1508	0.46
Party ID: Independent	-0.13	0.22	0.56	[-0.57, 0.31]	80	0.02
Party ID: Republican	-0.21	0.06	0.00	[-0.32, -0.10]	1678	0.51
Race: White	-0.16	0.05	0.00	[-0.27, -0.06]	2478	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.16	0.08	0.05	[-0.31, 0.00]	788	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.21	0.05	0.00	[-0.31, -0.10]	2154	0.66
Education: College	0.01	0.10	0.91	[-0.19, 0.21]	638	0.20
Education: Graduate School	-0.14	0.13	0.26	[-0.39, 0.11]	474	0.15
Gender: Male	-0.20	0.06	0.00	[-0.32, -0.07]	1725	0.53
Gender: Female	-0.12	0.06	0.04	[-0.25, -0.00]	1541	0.47
Ideology: Liberal	-0.09	0.08	0.25	[-0.24, 0.06]	854	0.26
Ideology: Moderate	-0.22	0.07	0.00	[-0.36, -0.09]	1155	0.35
Ideology: Conservative	-0.14	0.08	0.07	[-0.30, 0.01]	1257	0.38

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.18	0.05	0.00	[-0.27, -0.09]	1878	0.63
Age: 40 - 59	-0.25	0.07	0.00	[-0.39, -0.10]	853	0.29
Age: More than 60	-0.36	0.15	0.02	[-0.66, -0.06]	241	0.08
Party ID: Democrat	-0.16	0.04	0.00	[-0.25, -0.08]	1770	0.60
Party ID: Independent	-0.33	0.11	0.00	[-0.56, -0.11]	429	0.14
Party ID: Republican	-0.20	0.08	0.01	[-0.36, -0.05]	773	0.26
Race: White	-0.21	0.04	0.00	[-0.30, -0.12]	2262	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.23	0.07	0.00	[-0.38, -0.08]	710	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.16	0.05	0.00	[-0.27, -0.05]	1534	0.52
Education: College	-0.27	0.06	0.00	[-0.39, -0.15]	1069	0.36
Education: Graduate School	-0.27	0.10	0.01	[-0.47, -0.08]	369	0.12
Gender: Male	-0.23	0.06	0.00	[-0.34, -0.11]	1434	0.48
Gender: Female	-0.21	0.05	0.00	[-0.30, -0.11]	1538	0.52
Ideology: Liberal	-0.18	0.05	0.00	[-0.27, -0.09]	1409	0.47
Ideology: Moderate	-0.21	0.07	0.00	[-0.34, -0.08]	960	0.32
Ideology: Conservative	-0.26	0.10	0.01	[-0.45, -0.07]	603	0.20

Table 15: Jacobsen (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.43	0.17	0.01	[0.09, 0.76]	187	0.35
Age: 40 - 59	0.47	0.14	0.00	[0.19, 0.76]	201	0.37
Age: More than 60	0.87	0.19	0.00	[0.49, 1.25]	154	0.28
Party ID: Democrat	0.57	0.14	0.00	[0.30, 0.84]	293	0.54
Party ID: Independent	1.59	0.56	0.02	[0.29, 2.89]	10	0.02
Party ID: Republican	0.43	0.14	0.00	[0.17, 0.70]	239	0.44
Race: White	0.49	0.11	0.00	[0.28, 0.70]	392	0.72
Race: Nonwhite	0.68	0.20	0.00	[0.27, 1.08]	150	0.28
Education: Less than College	0.48	0.12	0.00	[0.24, 0.72]	386	0.71
Education: College	0.51	0.19	0.01	[0.14, 0.89]	95	0.18
Education: Graduate School	1.03	0.27	0.00	[0.50, 1.56]	61	0.11
Gender: Male	0.42	0.14	0.00	[0.14, 0.69]	271	0.50
Gender: Female	0.68	0.14	0.00	[0.41, 0.94]	271	0.50
Ideology: Liberal	0.43	0.18	0.02	[0.07, 0.79]	143	0.26
Ideology: Moderate	0.56	0.17	0.00	[0.23, 0.90]	192	0.35
Ideology: Conservative	0.63	0.15	0.00	[0.33, 0.93]	207	0.38
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.47	0.05	0.00	[0.36, 0.58]	750	0.76
Age: 40 - 59	0.46	0.13	0.00	[0.20, 0.72]	205	0.21
Age: More than 60	0.55	0.34	0.12	[-0.14, 1.25]	37	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	0.49	0.06	0.00	[0.37, 0.60]	659	0.66
Party ID: Independent	0.25	0.17	0.16	[-0.10, 0.59]	112	0.11
Party ID: Republican	0.46	0.12	0.00	[0.22, 0.70]	221	0.22
Race: White	0.46	0.06	0.00	[0.35, 0.58]	776	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.43	0.11	0.00	[0.21, 0.65]	216	0.22
Education: Less than College	0.47	0.07	0.00	[0.33, 0.61]	564	0.57
Education: College	0.44	0.08	0.00	[0.28, 0.61]	321	0.32
Education: Graduate School	0.49	0.16	0.00	[0.17, 0.81]	107	0.11
Gender: Male	0.50	0.07	0.00	[0.37, 0.63]	516	0.52
Gender: Female	0.42	0.08	0.00	[0.26, 0.57]	476	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	0.52	0.06	0.00	[0.39, 0.64]	558	0.56
Ideology: Moderate	0.27	0.11	0.01	[0.06, 0.48]	234	0.24
Ideology: Conservative	0.51	0.13	0.00	[0.25, 0.77]	200	0.20

Table 16: Johnston and Ballard (2016) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.30	0.09	0.00	[0.13, 0.47]	670	0.33
Age: 40 - 59	0.22	0.07	0.00	[0.08, 0.36]	769	0.38
Age: More than 60	0.23	0.09	0.01	[0.06, 0.40]	606	0.30
Party ID: Democrat	0.23	0.07	0.00	[0.10, 0.37]	1044	0.51
Party ID: Independent	0.14	0.22	0.53	[-0.30, 0.57]	89	0.04
Party ID: Republican	0.28	0.07	0.00	[0.15, 0.42]	912	0.45
Race: White	0.24	0.05	0.00	[0.14, 0.34]	1495	0.73
Race: Nonwhite	0.27	0.10	0.00	[0.09, 0.46]	550	0.27
Education: Less than College	0.27	0.05	0.00	[0.16, 0.37]	1363	0.67
Education: College	0.29	0.11	0.01	[0.07, 0.51]	397	0.19
Education: Graduate School	0.09	0.15	0.54	[-0.20, 0.38]	285	0.14
Gender: Male	0.27	0.07	0.00	[0.13, 0.40]	1013	0.50
Gender: Female	0.24	0.06	0.00	[0.11, 0.36]	1032	0.50
Ideology: Liberal	0.30	0.10	0.00	[0.12, 0.49]	551	0.27
Ideology: Moderate	0.23	0.08	0.00	[0.08, 0.38]	721	0.35
Ideology: Conservative	0.23	0.07	0.00	[0.08, 0.37]	773	0.38
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.42	0.02	0.00	[0.38, 0.46]	11285	0.76
Age: 40 - 59	0.37	0.03	0.00	[0.31, 0.44]	3135	0.21
Age: More than 60	0.29	0.09	0.00	[0.11, 0.46]	505	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	0.41	0.02	0.00	[0.37, 0.45]	9000	0.60
Party ID: Independent	0.34	0.04	0.00	[0.26, 0.42]	2275	0.15
Party ID: Republican	0.42	0.03	0.00	[0.36, 0.49]	3650	0.24
Race: White	0.40	0.02	0.00	[0.36, 0.43]	11445	0.77
Race: Nonwhite	0.42	0.03	0.00	[0.36, 0.49]	3480	0.23
Education: Less than College	0.41	0.02	0.00	[0.37, 0.46]	7465	0.50
Education: College	0.39	0.03	0.00	[0.34, 0.44]	5710	0.38
Education: Graduate School	0.40	0.05	0.00	[0.31, 0.49]	1750	0.12
Gender: Male	0.37	0.02	0.00	[0.32, 0.41]	7065	0.47
Gender: Female	0.44	0.02	0.00	[0.40, 0.49]	7860	0.53
Ideology: Liberal	0.39	0.02	0.00	[0.34, 0.43]	7000	0.47
Ideology: Moderate	0.40	0.03	0.00	[0.35, 0.46]	4900	0.33
Ideology: Conservative	0.46	0.04	0.00	[0.39, 0.53]	3025	0.20



Table 17: Levendusky and Malhotra (2015) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.20	0.15	0.17	[-0.09, 0.49]	345	0.33
Age: 40 - 59	0.04	0.13	0.77	[-0.21, 0.29]	397	0.38
Age: More than 60	0.25	0.14	0.07	[-0.02, 0.53]	311	0.30
Party ID: Democrat	0.18	0.11	0.11	[-0.04, 0.40]	469	0.45
Party ID: Independent	0.20	0.27	0.45	[-0.34, 0.74]	36	0.03
Party ID: Republican	0.14	0.12	0.24	[-0.09, 0.36]	548	0.52
Race: White	0.18	0.09	0.03	[0.02, 0.35]	777	0.74
Race: Nonwhite	0.11	0.17	0.51	[-0.22, 0.44]	276	0.26
Education: Less than College	0.18	0.10	0.08	[-0.02, 0.38]	700	0.66
Education: College	0.14	0.16	0.37	[-0.17, 0.45]	225	0.21
Education: Graduate School	0.07	0.21	0.75	[-0.35, 0.49]	128	0.12
Gender: Male	0.14	0.12	0.22	[-0.09, 0.38]	548	0.52
Gender: Female	0.18	0.11	0.11	[-0.04, 0.39]	505	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	0.07	0.14	0.61	[-0.20, 0.33]	318	0.30
Ideology: Moderate	0.40	0.15	0.01	[0.11, 0.70]	348	0.33
Ideology: Conservative	-0.00	0.13	1.00	[-0.26, 0.26]	387	0.37
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.34	0.07	0.00	[0.21, 0.47]	1254	0.63
Age: 40 - 59	0.45	0.09	0.00	[0.27, 0.62]	576	0.29
Age: More than 60	0.13	0.17	0.45	[-0.20, 0.45]	157	0.08
Party ID: Democrat	0.41	0.06	0.00	[0.29, 0.53]	1189	0.60
Party ID: Independent	0.22	0.14	0.12	[-0.06, 0.50]	288	0.14
Party ID: Republican	0.33	0.11	0.00	[0.12, 0.54]	510	0.26
Race: White	0.35	0.06	0.00	[0.24, 0.46]	1513	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.40	0.11	0.00	[0.18, 0.62]	474	0.24
Education: Less than College	0.35	0.07	0.00	[0.21, 0.49]	1039	0.52
Education: College	0.36	0.09	0.00	[0.19, 0.52]	698	0.35
Education: Graduate School	0.47	0.13	0.00	[0.22, 0.72]	250	0.13
Gender: Male	0.30	0.07	0.00	[0.16, 0.44]	966	0.49
Gender: Female	0.42	0.07	0.00	[0.28, 0.56]	1021	0.51
Ideology: Liberal	0.48	0.07	0.00	[0.34, 0.61]	947	0.48
Ideology: Moderate	0.34	0.09	0.00	[0.15, 0.52]	642	0.32
Ideology: Conservative	0.13	0.12	0.25	[-0.10, 0.37]	398	0.20

Table 18: McGinty, Webster, and Barry (2013) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.08	0.08	0.35	[-0.08, 0.23]	796	0.27
Age: 40 - 59	0.14	0.07	0.04	[0.01, 0.28]	1170	0.40
Age: More than 60	0.13	0.08	0.11	[-0.03, 0.29]	963	0.33
Party ID: Democrat	0.09	0.06	0.13	[-0.03, 0.21]	1510	0.52
Party ID: Independent	0.07	0.20	0.70	[-0.31, 0.46]	91	0.03
Party ID: Republican	0.14	0.07	0.03	[0.01, 0.28]	1328	0.45
Race: White	0.15	0.05	0.00	[0.05, 0.25]	2226	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.04	0.09	0.61	[-0.13, 0.22]	705	0.24
Education: Less than College	0.16	0.05	0.00	[0.05, 0.27]	1952	0.67
Education: College	-0.01	0.10	0.90	[-0.20, 0.18]	574	0.20
Education: Graduate School	0.02	0.12	0.84	[-0.22, 0.27]	403	0.14
Gender: Male	0.09	0.06	0.17	[-0.04, 0.21]	1457	0.50
Gender: Female	0.14	0.06	0.02	[0.02, 0.26]	1474	0.50
Ideology: Liberal	-0.03	0.09	0.71	[-0.20, 0.14]	836	0.29
Ideology: Moderate	0.27	0.07	0.00	[0.13, 0.41]	1008	0.34
Ideology: Conservative	0.06	0.07	0.38	[-0.08, 0.21]	1085	0.37
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.00	0.04	0.95	[-0.09, 0.09]	1861	0.75
Age: 40 - 59	0.05	0.09	0.57	[-0.12, 0.22]	534	0.22
Age: More than 60	-0.07	0.20	0.74	[-0.46, 0.33]	86	0.03
Party ID: Democrat	-0.01	0.04	0.81	[-0.09, 0.07]	1504	0.61
Party ID: Independent	0.08	0.10	0.42	[-0.12, 0.29]	370	0.15
Party ID: Republican	0.02	0.08	0.78	[-0.14, 0.18]	607	0.24
Race: White	-0.01	0.05	0.78	[-0.10, 0.08]	1925	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.09	0.08	0.23	[-0.06, 0.25]	558	0.22
Education: Less than College	0.01	0.06	0.82	[-0.10, 0.13]	1218	0.49
Education: College	0.00	0.06	0.98	[-0.12, 0.12]	960	0.39
Education: Graduate School	-0.05	0.10	0.66	[-0.25, 0.16]	303	0.12
Gender: Male	-0.04	0.06	0.47	[-0.16, 0.07]	1149	0.46
Gender: Female	0.04	0.05	0.40	[-0.06, 0.14]	1334	0.54
Ideology: Liberal	-0.05	0.05	0.26	[-0.15, 0.04]	1193	0.48
Ideology: Moderate	0.08	0.07	0.27	[-0.06, 0.22]	784	0.32
Ideology: Conservative	0.03	0.09	0.78	[-0.15, 0.20]	504	0.20

Table 19: Mello (2010) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.36	0.24	0.13	[-0.83, 0.11]	80	0.30
Age: 40 - 59	-0.40	0.25	0.11	[-0.89, 0.09]	110	0.41
Age: More than 60	-0.65	0.31	0.04	[-1.26, -0.04]	81	0.30
Race: White	-0.53	0.19	0.01	[-0.89, -0.16]	197	0.73
Race: Nonwhite	-0.22	0.25	0.37	[-0.72, 0.27]	74	0.27
Education: Less than College	-0.34	0.18	0.06	[-0.69, 0.01]	193	0.71
Education: College	-0.61	0.32	0.06	[-1.25, 0.04]	49	0.18
Education: Graduate School	-0.78	0.55	0.16	[-1.90, 0.34]	29	0.11
Gender: Male	-0.50	0.19	0.01	[-0.88, -0.12]	126	0.46
Gender: Female	-0.37	0.23	0.11	[-0.81, 0.08]	145	0.54

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.39	0.11	0.00	[-0.60, -0.18]	295	0.80
Age: 40 - 59	-0.42	0.22	0.06	[-0.86, 0.01]	68	0.18
Age: More than 60	-1.55	1.15	0.25	[-4.75, 1.66]	6	0.02
Race: White	-0.51	0.11	0.00	[-0.73, -0.30]	286	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	-0.06	0.19	0.74	[-0.45, 0.32]	83	0.22
Education: Less than College	-0.49	0.13	0.00	[-0.73, -0.24]	196	0.53
Education: College	-0.22	0.16	0.17	[-0.53, 0.10]	138	0.37
Education: Graduate School	-0.89	0.30	0.01	[-1.51, -0.27]	35	0.09
Gender: Male	-0.47	0.13	0.00	[-0.73, -0.21]	202	0.55
Gender: Female	-0.34	0.14	0.01	[-0.61, -0.07]	167	0.45

Table 20: Nicholson (2012) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.28	0.20	0.16	[-0.11, 0.67]	182	0.23
Age: 40 - 59	0.09	0.12	0.44	[-0.14, 0.33]	363	0.47
Age: More than 60	0.39	0.11	0.00	[0.17, 0.61]	233	0.30
Party ID: Democrat	0.19	0.12	0.13	[-0.06, 0.43]	427	0.55
Party ID: Republican	0.28	0.12	0.02	[0.05, 0.51]	354	0.45
Race: White	0.23	0.09	0.01	[0.05, 0.41]	616	0.79
Race: Nonwhite	0.28	0.19	0.14	[-0.10, 0.66]	163	0.21
Education: Less than College	0.19	0.11	0.08	[-0.02, 0.40]	525	0.67
Education: College	0.33	0.17	0.05	[-0.01, 0.66]	178	0.23
Education: Graduate School	0.25	0.23	0.30	[-0.22, 0.71]	75	0.10
Gender: Male	0.11	0.12	0.37	[-0.13, 0.34]	412	0.53
Gender: Female	0.36	0.12	0.00	[0.12, 0.60]	367	0.47
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.12	0.07	0.10	[-0.02, 0.26]	817	0.75
Age: 40 - 59	0.07	0.14	0.62	[-0.21, 0.34]	233	0.21
Age: More than 60	0.05	0.28	0.86	[-0.52, 0.62]	46	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	0.05	0.07	0.44	[-0.08, 0.19]	736	0.67
Party ID: Republican	0.22	0.13	0.08	[-0.03, 0.47]	363	0.33
Race: White	0.12	0.07	0.09	[-0.02, 0.27]	753	0.69
Race: Nonwhite	0.07	0.12	0.55	[-0.16, 0.30]	344	0.31
Education: Less than College	0.14	0.10	0.14	[-0.05, 0.33]	460	0.42
Education: College	0.08	0.09	0.40	[-0.11, 0.26]	481	0.44
Education: Graduate School	0.08	0.14	0.60	[-0.21, 0.36]	155	0.14
Gender: Male	0.12	0.08	0.13	[-0.04, 0.28]	637	0.58
Gender: Female	0.08	0.10	0.42	[-0.12, 0.27]	460	0.42

Table 21: Parmer (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	0.19	0.17	0.27	[-0.15, 0.52]	170	0.33
Age: 40 - 59	0.02	0.18	0.92	[-0.33, 0.36]	202	0.39
Age: More than 60	-0.28	0.19	0.14	[-0.65, 0.10]	147	0.28
Party ID: Democrat	-0.00	0.13	0.99	[-0.25, 0.25]	267	0.51
Party ID: Independent	0.50	0.78	0.52	[-1.13, 2.13]	20	0.04
Party ID: Republican	-0.01	0.17	0.96	[-0.33, 0.32]	232	0.45
Race: White	-0.08	0.12	0.53	[-0.32, 0.16]	373	0.72
Race: Nonwhite	0.20	0.19	0.31	[-0.18, 0.58]	146	0.28
Education: Less than College	-0.04	0.13	0.74	[-0.30, 0.22]	367	0.71
Education: College	0.10	0.18	0.60	[-0.27, 0.46]	88	0.17
Education: Graduate School	0.24	0.18	0.18	[-0.11, 0.60]	64	0.12
Gender: Male	-0.10	0.12	0.37	[-0.33, 0.12]	271	0.52
Gender: Female	0.12	0.17	0.48	[-0.21, 0.45]	248	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	0.29	0.17	0.09	[-0.04, 0.63]	144	0.28
Ideology: Moderate	-0.04	0.19	0.85	[-0.42, 0.35]	166	0.32
Ideology: Conservative	-0.16	0.16	0.32	[-0.48, 0.16]	209	0.40
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.03	0.04	0.45	[-0.12, 0.05]	1563	0.75
Age: 40 - 59	-0.04	0.09	0.70	[-0.22, 0.14]	438	0.21
Age: More than 60	-0.32	0.21	0.14	[-0.74, 0.10]	86	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	0.01	0.05	0.85	[-0.08, 0.10]	1295	0.62
Party ID: Independent	-0.12	0.14	0.40	[-0.39, 0.16]	283	0.14
Party ID: Republican	-0.11	0.08	0.16	[-0.27, 0.05]	509	0.24
Race: White	-0.07	0.04	0.10	[-0.16, 0.01]	1623	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.05	0.09	0.56	[-0.12, 0.22]	464	0.22
Education: Less than College	-0.09	0.06	0.12	[-0.21, 0.02]	1100	0.53
Education: College	0.06	0.06	0.30	[-0.06, 0.18]	718	0.34
Education: Graduate School	-0.14	0.09	0.10	[-0.31, 0.03]	269	0.13
Gender: Male	-0.06	0.06	0.26	[-0.17, 0.05]	998	0.48
Gender: Female	-0.03	0.06	0.62	[-0.14, 0.08]	1089	0.52
Ideology: Liberal	0.01	0.05	0.84	[-0.08, 0.10]	1146	0.55
Ideology: Moderate	-0.04	0.09	0.65	[-0.22, 0.14]	487	0.23
Ideology: Conservative	-0.16	0.09	0.07	[-0.34, 0.01]	454	0.22

Table 22: Pedulla (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.20	0.21	0.32	[-0.21, 0.61]	79	0.29
Age: 40 - 59	-0.13	0.25	0.61	[-0.63, 0.37]	105	0.38
Age: More than 60	0.18	0.25	0.48	[-0.32, 0.69]	90	0.33
Party ID: Democrat	0.26	0.16	0.11	[-0.06, 0.58]	147	0.54
Party ID: Independent	-2.02	0.75	0.07	[-4.41, 0.37]	5	0.02
Party ID: Republican	-0.09	0.24	0.71	[-0.56, 0.38]	122	0.45
Race: White	0.01	0.17	0.95	[-0.33, 0.36]	200	0.73
Race: Nonwhite	0.21	0.22	0.33	[-0.22, 0.65]	74	0.27
Education: Less than College	0.09	0.17	0.57	[-0.23, 0.42]	181	0.66
Education: College	-0.09	0.32	0.77	[-0.74, 0.55]	68	0.25
Education: Graduate School	0.30	0.31	0.35	[-0.34, 0.94]	25	0.09
Gender: Male	0.11	0.20	0.60	[-0.30, 0.51]	137	0.50
Gender: Female	0.05	0.18	0.79	[-0.31, 0.41]	137	0.50
Ideology: Liberal	0.45	0.27	0.10	[-0.09, 0.99]	71	0.26
Ideology: Moderate	0.06	0.18	0.74	[-0.30, 0.42]	105	0.38
Ideology: Conservative	-0.13	0.26	0.60	[-0.65, 0.38]	98	0.36

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.04	0.09	0.68	[-0.14, 0.22]	277	0.80
Age: 40 - 59	-0.01	0.14	0.92	[-0.29, 0.26]	56	0.16
Age: More than 60	-0.00	0.00	0.55	[-0.00, 0.00]	13	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	0.03	0.09	0.76	[-0.15, 0.20]	213	0.62
Party ID: Independent	0.03	0.24	0.89	[-0.45, 0.51]	49	0.14
Party ID: Republican	0.01	0.18	0.94	[-0.34, 0.36]	84	0.24
Race: White	-0.04	0.08	0.63	[-0.21, 0.12]	279	0.81
Race: Nonwhite	0.30	0.18	0.10	[-0.06, 0.67]	67	0.19
Education: Less than College	-0.09	0.11	0.40	[-0.30, 0.12]	190	0.55
Education: College	0.24	0.11	0.04	[0.01, 0.46]	123	0.36
Education: Graduate School	-0.06	0.28	0.82	[-0.63, 0.51]	33	0.10
Gender: Male	-0.08	0.12	0.50	[-0.31, 0.15]	177	0.51
Gender: Female	0.13	0.10	0.18	[-0.06, 0.33]	169	0.49
Ideology: Liberal	0.01	0.10	0.91	[-0.18, 0.20]	204	0.59
Ideology: Moderate	0.11	0.21	0.61	[-0.31, 0.52]	73	0.21
Ideology: Conservative	-0.07	0.13	0.61	[-0.33, 0.20]	69	0.20

Table 23: Peffley and Hurwitz (2007) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.38	0.14	0.01	[-0.66, -0.11]	382	0.42
Age: 40 - 59	-0.44	0.16	0.01	[-0.75, -0.13]	373	0.41
Age: More than 60	-0.33	0.16	0.04	[-0.64, -0.02]	150	0.17
Race: White	-0.31	0.08	0.00	[-0.47, -0.15]	470	0.52
Race: Nonwhite	-0.37	0.15	0.01	[-0.66, -0.08]	435	0.48
Education: Less than College	-0.48	0.11	0.00	[-0.70, -0.27]	636	0.70
Education: College	-0.40	0.18	0.03	[-0.76, -0.04]	193	0.21
Education: Graduate School	0.16	0.28	0.57	[-0.40, 0.71]	76	0.08
Gender: Male	-0.48	0.15	0.00	[-0.78, -0.18]	353	0.39
Gender: Female	-0.36	0.11	0.00	[-0.59, -0.13]	552	0.61
Ideology: Liberal	-0.33	0.15	0.03	[-0.63, -0.04]	206	0.23
Ideology: Moderate	-0.48	0.13	0.00	[-0.74, -0.22]	442	0.49
Ideology: Conservative	-0.34	0.19	0.08	[-0.72, 0.04]	257	0.28
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.11	0.05	0.04	[-0.22, -0.01]	956	0.74
Age: 40 - 59	-0.05	0.11	0.66	[-0.27, 0.17]	268	0.21
Age: More than 60	-0.13	0.23	0.58	[-0.59, 0.33]	61	0.05
Race: White	-0.08	0.06	0.17	[-0.20, 0.04]	875	0.68
Race: Nonwhite	-0.15	0.08	0.05	[-0.30, 0.00]	410	0.32
Education: Less than College	-0.17	0.07	0.02	[-0.32, -0.02]	535	0.42
Education: College	-0.10	0.07	0.18	[-0.23, 0.04]	569	0.44
Education: Graduate School	0.04	0.13	0.74	[-0.21, 0.30]	181	0.14
Gender: Male	-0.16	0.06	0.01	[-0.29, -0.04]	737	0.57
Gender: Female	-0.02	0.07	0.82	[-0.16, 0.13]	548	0.43
Ideology: Liberal	-0.12	0.07	0.09	[-0.26, 0.02]	574	0.45
Ideology: Moderate	-0.04	0.07	0.58	[-0.18, 0.10]	456	0.35
Ideology: Conservative	-0.14	0.11	0.18	[-0.35, 0.07]	255	0.20

Table 24: Piazza (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.22	0.20	0.27	[-0.17, 0.61]	139	0.31
Age: 40 - 59	-0.25	0.18	0.15	[-0.60, 0.10]	173	0.39
Age: More than 60	0.06	0.21	0.77	[-0.35, 0.47]	131	0.30
Party ID: Democrat	0.23	0.14	0.10	[-0.04, 0.50]	236	0.53
Party ID: Independent	-0.25	0.67	0.71	[-1.77, 1.26]	11	0.02
Party ID: Republican	-0.23	0.18	0.20	[-0.58, 0.12]	196	0.44
Race: White	0.04	0.13	0.76	[-0.22, 0.30]	336	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.04	0.21	0.86	[-0.46, 0.38]	107	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.03	0.13	0.85	[-0.29, 0.24]	299	0.67
Education: College	0.22	0.24	0.36	[-0.25, 0.70]	88	0.20
Education: Graduate School	-0.08	0.30	0.79	[-0.68, 0.52]	56	0.13
Gender: Male	-0.16	0.17	0.36	[-0.49, 0.18]	226	0.51
Gender: Female	0.17	0.15	0.24	[-0.11, 0.46]	217	0.49
Ideology: Liberal	0.34	0.20	0.09	[-0.05, 0.74]	122	0.28
Ideology: Moderate	-0.06	0.17	0.74	[-0.40, 0.29]	152	0.34
Ideology: Conservative	-0.07	0.20	0.74	[-0.46, 0.33]	169	0.38

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.11	0.08	0.19	[-0.26, 0.05]	651	0.76
Age: 40 - 59	0.14	0.14	0.33	[-0.14, 0.43]	187	0.22
Age: More than 60	0.44	0.40	0.30	[-0.41, 1.28]	21	0.02
Party ID: Democrat	-0.07	0.08	0.41	[-0.23, 0.09]	549	0.64
Party ID: Independent	0.10	0.22	0.66	[-0.35, 0.54]	99	0.12
Party ID: Republican	0.04	0.14	0.80	[-0.24, 0.32]	211	0.25
Race: White	0.03	0.08	0.75	[-0.13, 0.18]	653	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.22	0.13	0.10	[-0.49, 0.04]	206	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.04	0.10	0.65	[-0.23, 0.15]	467	0.54
Education: College	-0.01	0.11	0.95	[-0.23, 0.21]	294	0.34
Education: Graduate School	-0.11	0.21	0.60	[-0.52, 0.30]	98	0.11
Gender: Male	-0.12	0.10	0.23	[-0.32, 0.08]	448	0.52
Gender: Female	0.06	0.09	0.52	[-0.12, 0.24]	411	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	-0.16	0.09	0.06	[-0.33, 0.01]	486	0.57
Ideology: Moderate	0.11	0.15	0.47	[-0.19, 0.40]	187	0.22
Ideology: Conservative	0.12	0.15	0.40	[-0.17, 0.42]	186	0.22



Table 25: Shafer (2010) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.25	0.12	0.03	[-0.49, -0.02]	294	0.34
Age: 40 - 59	-0.06	0.15	0.69	[-0.35, 0.23]	346	0.40
Age: More than 60	-0.08	0.15	0.61	[-0.37, 0.22]	230	0.26
Party ID: Democrat	-0.16	0.12	0.18	[-0.38, 0.07]	457	0.53
Party ID: Independent	-0.61	0.42	0.16	[-1.48, 0.26]	28	0.03
Party ID: Republican	-0.07	0.11	0.49	[-0.29, 0.14]	385	0.44
Race: White	-0.17	0.08	0.04	[-0.34, -0.01]	648	0.74
Race: Nonwhite	-0.07	0.18	0.69	[-0.42, 0.28]	222	0.26
Education: Less than College	-0.07	0.09	0.44	[-0.26, 0.11]	622	0.71
Education: College	-0.28	0.17	0.11	[-0.62, 0.06]	170	0.20
Education: Graduate School	-0.37	0.28	0.20	[-0.93, 0.19]	78	0.09
Gender: Male	0.01	0.12	0.96	[-0.23, 0.25]	426	0.49
Gender: Female	-0.27	0.10	0.01	[-0.48, -0.07]	444	0.51
Ideology: Liberal	-0.14	0.17	0.42	[-0.47, 0.19]	231	0.27
Ideology: Moderate	-0.12	0.14	0.41	[-0.39, 0.16]	316	0.36
Ideology: Conservative	-0.15	0.11	0.16	[-0.37, 0.06]	323	0.37
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.05	0.06	0.41	[-0.18, 0.07]	649	0.77
Age: 40 - 59	-0.02	0.14	0.91	[-0.29, 0.26]	159	0.19
Age: More than 60	-0.34	0.32	0.30	[-1.01, 0.32]	32	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	-0.06	0.07	0.38	[-0.21, 0.08]	523	0.62
Party ID: Independent	0.03	0.17	0.85	[-0.30, 0.36]	124	0.15
Party ID: Republican	-0.07	0.11	0.56	[-0.29, 0.16]	193	0.23
Race: White	0.01	0.07	0.83	[-0.11, 0.14]	637	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.26	0.13	0.04	[-0.51, -0.01]	203	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.05	0.08	0.57	[-0.21, 0.11]	457	0.54
Education: College	-0.05	0.09	0.56	[-0.23, 0.13]	293	0.35
Education: Graduate School	-0.07	0.18	0.70	[-0.42, 0.28]	90	0.11
Gender: Male	-0.01	0.08	0.92	[-0.16, 0.14]	431	0.51
Gender: Female	-0.10	0.09	0.25	[-0.28, 0.07]	409	0.49
Ideology: Liberal	-0.09	0.08	0.27	[-0.24, 0.07]	459	0.55
Ideology: Moderate	0.03	0.12	0.80	[-0.21, 0.27]	212	0.25
Ideology: Conservative	-0.06	0.13	0.61	[-0.31, 0.19]	169	0.20

Table 26: Thompson (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.02	0.20	0.91	[-0.41, 0.37]	124	0.31
Age: 40 - 59	-0.23	0.20	0.24	[-0.62, 0.16]	153	0.38
Age: More than 60	-0.06	0.22	0.78	[-0.50, 0.38]	123	0.31
Party ID: Democrat	-0.08	0.17	0.65	[-0.41, 0.26]	208	0.52
Party ID: Independent	-0.71	0.53	0.21	[-1.90, 0.47]	12	0.03
Party ID: Republican	-0.12	0.17	0.48	[-0.46, 0.22]	180	0.45
Race: White	-0.07	0.13	0.58	[-0.32, 0.18]	304	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	-0.21	0.25	0.40	[-0.71, 0.29]	96	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.07	0.15	0.64	[-0.35, 0.22]	269	0.67
Education: College	-0.10	0.26	0.71	[-0.60, 0.41]	76	0.19
Education: Graduate School	-0.24	0.30	0.42	[-0.83, 0.35]	55	0.14
Gender: Male	-0.07	0.17	0.70	[-0.41, 0.28]	205	0.51
Gender: Female	-0.15	0.16	0.36	[-0.46, 0.17]	195	0.49
Ideology: Liberal	0.03	0.25	0.91	[-0.46, 0.52]	106	0.27
Ideology: Moderate	-0.24	0.20	0.25	[-0.64, 0.17]	139	0.35
Ideology: Conservative	-0.07	0.17	0.67	[-0.40, 0.26]	155	0.39

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.05	0.06	0.39	[-0.18, 0.07]	991	0.74
Age: 40 - 59	-0.00	0.12	0.99	[-0.23, 0.23]	288	0.21
Age: More than 60	-0.33	0.24	0.17	[-0.81, 0.15]	66	0.05
Party ID: Democrat	-0.09	0.07	0.18	[-0.23, 0.04]	825	0.61
Party ID: Independent	-0.11	0.14	0.43	[-0.38, 0.17]	182	0.14
Party ID: Republican	-0.03	0.11	0.76	[-0.24, 0.18]	338	0.25
Race: White	-0.02	0.06	0.72	[-0.14, 0.10]	1040	0.77
Race: Nonwhite	-0.14	0.12	0.24	[-0.39, 0.10]	305	0.23
Education: Less than College	0.03	0.08	0.69	[-0.12, 0.18]	711	0.53
Education: College	-0.14	0.09	0.12	[-0.32, 0.04]	443	0.33
Education: Graduate School	-0.14	0.14	0.30	[-0.42, 0.13]	191	0.14
Gender: Male	0.03	0.08	0.70	[-0.12, 0.19]	608	0.45
Gender: Female	-0.11	0.07	0.12	[-0.26, 0.03]	737	0.55
Ideology: Liberal	-0.04	0.07	0.61	[-0.18, 0.10]	740	0.55
Ideology: Moderate	-0.10	0.12	0.39	[-0.33, 0.13]	315	0.23
Ideology: Conservative	-0.08	0.12	0.50	[-0.31, 0.15]	290	0.22

Table 27: Transue (2007) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.19	0.16	0.23	[-0.12, 0.50]	158	0.46
Age: 40 - 59	0.19	0.16	0.26	[-0.14, 0.51]	124	0.36
Age: More than 60	0.15	0.26	0.56	[-0.37, 0.67]	60	0.18
Party ID: Democrat	0.16	0.14	0.26	[-0.12, 0.45]	166	0.49
Party ID: Independent	0.62	0.26	0.02	[0.09, 1.15]	49	0.14
Party ID: Republican	0.02	0.18	0.93	[-0.33, 0.36]	127	0.37
Race: White	0.18	0.10	0.09	[-0.03, 0.38]	344	1.00
Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	-0.08	0.11	0.50	[-0.30, 0.15]	252	0.69
Age: 40 - 59	0.08	0.19	0.68	[-0.31, 0.47]	89	0.24
Age: More than 60	-0.50	0.45	0.28	[-1.44, 0.43]	23	0.06
Party ID: Democrat	0.09	0.11	0.43	[-0.13, 0.31]	199	0.55
Party ID: Independent	-0.21	0.22	0.35	[-0.66, 0.23]	72	0.20
Party ID: Republican	-0.11	0.19	0.56	[-0.48, 0.26]	93	0.26
Race: White	-0.08	0.10	0.43	[-0.26, 0.11]	366	1.00

Table 28: Turaga (2010) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.12	0.20	0.57	[-0.28, 0.51]	156	0.31
Age: 40 - 59	0.01	0.18	0.96	[-0.34, 0.36]	190	0.38
Age: More than 60	0.30	0.18	0.09	[-0.05, 0.65]	151	0.30
Party ID: Democrat	0.25	0.13	0.06	[-0.01, 0.51]	270	0.54
Party ID: Independent	0.23	0.55	0.68	[-0.90, 1.36]	26	0.05
Party ID: Republican	0.02	0.19	0.91	[-0.36, 0.41]	201	0.40
Race: White	0.10	0.13	0.44	[-0.16, 0.36]	378	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.16	0.19	0.40	[-0.22, 0.54]	119	0.24
Education: Less than College	0.11	0.13	0.39	[-0.14, 0.37]	358	0.72
Education: College	-0.01	0.26	0.98	[-0.52, 0.51]	95	0.19
Education: Graduate School	0.52	0.36	0.15	[-0.20, 1.24]	44	0.09
Gender: Male	0.16	0.15	0.28	[-0.13, 0.46]	244	0.49
Gender: Female	0.08	0.16	0.59	[-0.23, 0.39]	253	0.51
Ideology: Liberal	0.21	0.19	0.28	[-0.17, 0.58]	136	0.27
Ideology: Moderate	0.24	0.16	0.14	[-0.08, 0.56]	178	0.36
Ideology: Conservative	-0.02	0.20	0.94	[-0.42, 0.38]	183	0.37

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk				N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p	95% CI		
Age: 18 - 39	0.31	0.10	0.00	[0.12, 0.51]	519	0.76
Age: 40 - 59	0.19	0.20	0.34	[-0.21, 0.59]	130	0.19
Age: More than 60	-0.79	0.46	0.09	[-1.72, 0.14]	33	0.05
Party ID: Democrat	0.30	0.11	0.01	[0.08, 0.52]	413	0.61
Party ID: Independent	0.31	0.26	0.23	[-0.20, 0.82]	92	0.13
Party ID: Republican	0.07	0.17	0.66	[-0.26, 0.40]	177	0.26
Race: White	0.22	0.10	0.02	[0.03, 0.41]	534	0.78
Race: Nonwhite	0.35	0.20	0.08	[-0.04, 0.74]	148	0.22
Education: Less than College	0.25	0.12	0.04	[0.01, 0.49]	346	0.51
Education: College	0.23	0.15	0.12	[-0.06, 0.53]	242	0.35
Education: Graduate School	0.27	0.26	0.29	[-0.24, 0.78]	94	0.14
Gender: Male	0.29	0.12	0.02	[0.06, 0.53]	312	0.46
Gender: Female	0.26	0.12	0.03	[0.02, 0.50]	370	0.54
Ideology: Liberal	0.35	0.12	0.00	[0.12, 0.57]	375	0.55
Ideology: Moderate	0.20	0.19	0.29	[-0.18, 0.58]	153	0.22
Ideology: Conservative	0.05	0.19	0.80	[-0.32, 0.42]	154	0.23

Table 29: Wallace (2011) Original and Replication Results

Covariate Class	Original			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-0.49	0.18	0.01	[-0.86, -0.13]	139	0.30
Age: 40 - 59	-0.76	0.15	0.00	[-1.06, -0.46]	181	0.39
Age: More than 60	-0.69	0.22	0.00	[-1.11, -0.26]	147	0.31
Party ID: Democrat	-0.44	0.15	0.00	[-0.73, -0.15]	235	0.50
Party ID: Independent	-0.30	0.25	0.26	[-0.85, 0.25]	14	0.03
Party ID: Republican	-0.90	0.16	0.00	[-1.20, -0.59]	218	0.47
Race: White	-0.99	0.12	0.00	[-1.22, -0.77]	354	0.76
Race: Nonwhite	0.14	0.18	0.46	[-0.23, 0.50]	113	0.24
Education: Less than College	-0.67	0.13	0.00	[-0.93, -0.42]	317	0.68
Education: College	-0.52	0.19	0.01	[-0.90, -0.13]	96	0.21
Education: Graduate School	-0.75	0.28	0.01	[-1.30, -0.19]	54	0.12
Gender: Male	-0.65	0.14	0.00	[-0.92, -0.38]	244	0.52
Gender: Female	-0.63	0.16	0.00	[-0.94, -0.32]	223	0.48
Ideology: Liberal	-0.45	0.23	0.05	[-0.90, -0.01]	108	0.23
Ideology: Moderate	-0.74	0.16	0.00	[-1.05, -0.43]	179	0.38
Ideology: Conservative	-0.63	0.18	0.00	[-0.99, -0.27]	180	0.39

  

Covariate Class	Mechanical Turk			95% CI	N	Prop
	CATE	SE	p			
Age: 18 - 39	-1.14	0.11	0.00	[-1.35, -0.92]	340	0.75
Age: 40 - 59	-1.08	0.20	0.00	[-1.48, -0.69]	98	0.22
Age: More than 60	-1.21	0.63	0.08	[-2.56, 0.15]	16	0.04
Party ID: Democrat	-1.14	0.12	0.00	[-1.38, -0.89]	277	0.61
Party ID: Independent	-1.13	0.29	0.00	[-1.71, -0.56]	59	0.13
Party ID: Republican	-1.06	0.17	0.00	[-1.39, -0.72]	118	0.26
Race: White	-1.20	0.11	0.00	[-1.41, -0.98]	336	0.74
Race: Nonwhite	-0.88	0.19	0.00	[-1.25, -0.50]	118	0.26
Education: Less than College	-1.07	0.13	0.00	[-1.32, -0.81]	271	0.60
Education: College	-1.15	0.16	0.00	[-1.46, -0.84]	146	0.32
Education: Graduate School	-1.29	0.28	0.00	[-1.85, -0.73]	37	0.08
Gender: Male	-1.29	0.14	0.00	[-1.56, -1.02]	224	0.49
Gender: Female	-0.93	0.13	0.00	[-1.19, -0.67]	230	0.51
Ideology: Liberal	-1.10	0.13	0.00	[-1.36, -0.83]	252	0.56
Ideology: Moderate	-1.10	0.19	0.00	[-1.48, -0.72]	101	0.22
Ideology: Conservative	-1.17	0.19	0.00	[-1.55, -0.79]	101	0.22

## References

- Bergan, Daniel. 2012. "The Flexible Correction Model and Party Labels." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Brader, Ted. 2005. "Striking a Responsive Chord: How Political Ads Motivate and Persuade Voters by Appealing to Emotions." *American Journal of Political Science* 49(2):388–405.
- Brandt, Mark. 2009. "Onset and Offset Controllability in Perceptions and Reactions to Home Mortgage Foreclosures." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Caprariello, Peter. 2011. "To Do, to Have, or to Share? Valuing Experiences and Material Possessions by Involving Others." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Chong, Dennis and James N. Druckman. 2010. "Dynamic Public Opinion: Communication Effects over Time." *American Political Science Review* 104(04):663–680.
- Converse, Benjamin A. and Nicholas Epley. 2007. "With God on Our Side." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Coppock, Alexander. forthcoming. "Generalizing from Survey Experiments Conducted on Mechanical Turk: A Replication Approach." *Political Science Research and Methods* .
- Craig, Maureen A. and Jennifer A. Richeson. 2014. "More Diverse Yet Less Tolerant? How the Increasingly Diverse Racial Landscape Affects White Americans' Racial Attitudes." *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 40(6):750–761.
- Denny, Kathleen. 2012. "Examining the Raced Fatherhood Premium: Workplace Evaluations of Men by Race, Fatherhood Status, and Level of Involvement." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Flavin, Patrick J. 2011. "Public Attitudes about Political Equality." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Gash, Alison and Michael Murakami. 2009. "Understanding How Policy Venue Influences Public Opinion." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Hiscox, Michael J. 2006. "Through a Glass and Darkly: Attitudes Toward International Trade and the Curious Effects of Issue Framing." *International Organization* 60(03):755–780.
- Hopkins, Daniel J. and Jonathan Mummolo. 2017. "Assessing the Breadth of Framing Effects." *Quarterly Journal of Political Science* .
- Jacobsen, Rebecca. 2011. "Informing the Public or Information Overload? The influence of school accountability data format and on public satisfaction." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Jacobsen, Rebecca, Jeffrey W. Snyder and Andrew Saultz. 2014. "Informing or Shaping Public Opinion? The Influence of School Accountability Data Format on Public Perceptions of School Quality." *American Journal of Education* 121(1):1–27.
- Johnston, Christopher D. and Andrew O. Ballard. 2016. "Economists and Public Opinion: Expert Consensus and Economic Policy Judgments." *The Journal of Politics* 78(2):443–456.
- Levendusky, Matthew and Neil Malhotra. 2015. "Does Media Coverage of Partisan Polarization Affect Political Attitudes ?" *Political Communication* .

- McGinty, Emma E., Daniel W. Webster and Colleen L. Barry. 2013. "Effects of News Media Messages about Mass Shootings on Attitudes Toward Persons with Serious Mental Illness and Public Support for Gun Control Policies." *American Journal of Psychiatry* 170(5):494–501.
- Mello, Michelle. 2010. "Patient Responses to Medical Error Disclosure: Does Compensation Matter?" *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Mullinix, Kevin J., Thomas J. Leeper, James N. Druckman and Jeremy Freese. 2015. "The Generalizability of Survey Experiments." *Journal of Experimental Political Science* 2:109–138.
- Nicholson, Stephen P. 2012. "Polarizing Cues." *American Journal of Political Science* 56(1):52–66.
- Parmer, John. 2011. "Smallpox Vaccine Recommendations: Could Trust be a Shot in the Arm?" *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Pedulla, David S. 2011. "The Mechanisms of Labor Market Discrimination: How Sex, Gender Role, and Sexual Orientation Treatments Impact Evaluations of Black Male Job Applicants." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Pedulla, David S. 2014. "The Positive Consequences of Negative Stereotypes: Race, Sexual Orientation, and the Job Application Process." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 77(1):75–94.
- Peffley, Mark and Jon Hurwitz. 2007. "Persuasion and Resistance: Race and the Death Penalty in America." *American Journal of Political Science* 51(4):996–1012.
- Piazza, James A. 2011. "Terrorism Suspect Religious Identity and Public Support for Controversial Detention and Interrogation Practices." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Piazza, James A. 2015. "Terrorist Suspect Religious Identity and Public Support for Harsh Interrogation and Detention Practices." *Political Psychology* 36(6):667–690.
- Shafer, Emily. 2010. "Why Hillary Rodham Became Hillary Clinton: Consequences of Non-Traditional Last Name Choice in Marriage." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Thompson, Suzanne C. 2011. "Terrorist Threat: Overreactions, Underreactions, and Realistic Reaction." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Transue, John E. 2007. "Identity Salience, Identity Acceptance, and Racial Policy Attitudes: American National Identity as a Uniting Force." *American Journal of Political Science* 51(1):78–91.
- Turaga, Mohana. 2010. "Environmental Values, Beliefs, and Behavior." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .
- Wallace, Geoffrey P.R. 2011. "The Reputational Consequences of International Law and Compliance." *Time Sharing Experiments for the Social Sciences* .